Matthew G. Bevin Governor



Derrick Ramsey Secretary Education and Workforce Development Cabinet

# Wayne D. Lewis, Jr., Ph.D. Commissioner of Education

## KENTUCKY DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

300 Sower Boulevard • Frankfort, Kentucky 40601 Phone: (502) 564-3141 • www.education.ky.gov

May 8, 2019

Senator Stephen West Capitol Annex Room 229 Frankfort, KY 40601

Re: 704 KAR 8:060, Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies

Dear Senator West and ARRS members:

In preparation of the upcoming May 14 ARRS meeting, I wanted to provide information related to the development process of 704 KAR 8:060, the Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies. For context, KRS 156.160 requires the Kentucky Board of Education (KBE) to establish courses of study for the different grades and kinds of common schools, with the courses of study to comply with the expected goals, outcomes and assessment strategies developed under KRS 158.645, 158.6451 and 158.6453. KRS 156.070(1) requires the KBE to manage and control the common schools and all programs operated in the schools. KRS 160.290 authorizes local boards of education to provide for courses and other services for students consistent with the administrative regulations of the KBE. This administrative regulation incorporates by reference the required academic standards for social studies, which contain the general courses of study and academic content standards for use in Kentucky's common schools.

Pursuant to KRS 158.6453, as amended by SB 1 (2017), the Kentucky Department of Education (KDE) began the review and revision process for current academic standards in social studies in January 2018. Standards outline what students are expected to know and do in each grade to successfully transition to the next level of learning, not how they are taught. The curriculum or methods and materials used to teach the standards is decided at the local level.

SB 1 (2017) required the KDE to implement a process for reviewing all academic standards and aligned assessments beginning in the 2017-2018 school year. Therefore, this process was used to review and revise the social studies standards. A detailed report listing each step of the process also is included; however, a summary of the development timeline is provided below.

# Social Studies Standards Development Timeline

- Call for Committee Member Applications January 23 February 13, 2018
- Open First Round of Public Feedback Survey (Appalachia Regional Comprehensive Center (ARCC)) January 23, 2018
- Close First Round of Public Feedback Survey (ARCC) February 22, 2018
- Social Studies Standards Advisory Panel (AP) Meeting March 7-9, 2018
- Social Standards Review/Development Committee (RDC) Meeting April 12-13, 2018
- Social Studies Standards AP meeting April 25-26, 2018



- Social Studies Standards Joint AP and RDC Subcommittee Meeting May 1-3, 2018
- Social Studies Standards Joint AP and RDC Subcommittee Meeting May 10-11, 2018
- Social Standards RDC Meeting May 17, 2018
- Social Studies Standards Joint AP and RDC Subcommittee Meeting May 17-18, 2018
- Social Studies Focus Group June 5, 2018
- Social Studies Focus Group June 7, 2018
- Social Studies Standards Joint AP and RDC Subcommittee Meeting June 13-15, 2018
- Social Studies Standards Joint AP and RDC Subcommittee Meeting June 21-22, 2018
- Social Studies Focus Group July 18, 2018
- Open Second Round of Public Feedback Survey (ARCC) August 29, 2018
- Close Second Round of Public Feedback Survey (ARCC) September 27, 2018
- Social Studies Focus Group September 15, 2018
- Social Standards RDC Meeting September 21, 2018
- Social Studies Standards AP Meeting September 28, 2018
- Social Studies Standards AP Meeting October 15-16, 2018
- Social Studies Standards RDC Meeting October 19, 2018
- Interim Joint Committee on Education Meeting (IJCE) November 19, 2018
- Kentucky Board of Education (KBE) First Reading to Consider Adoption December 5, 2018
- Social Studies Focus Groups December 10, 2018
- Social Studies Standards AP Meeting December 11, 2018
- Social Studies Standards AP Subcommittee Meeting December 12, 2018
- Social Studies Standards RDC Meeting December 14, 2018
- Social Studies Standards Joint AP and RDC Subcommittee Meeting January 5, 2019
- KBE Second Reading and Adoption of 704 KAR 8:060 February 6, 2019
- Open Regulatory Public Comment March 1-31, 2019
- Statement of Consideration Presented to the KBE April 10, 2019
- KBE Accepted the Changes Proposed in the Statement of Consideration April 10, 2019

As you can see, the process involved with the development of the Kentucky Academic Standards is intentionally aligned with SB 1 (2017). These standards truly reflect the intent of the legislation, yielding a set of standards developed by Kentucky educators for Kentucky educators. I hope this information addresses any concerns you might have regarding 704 KAR 8:060, Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies. Please contact me if you have questions.

Sincerely,

Wup D. Fr. Jr.

Wayne D. Lewis, Jr., Ph.D. Commissioner of Education

Attachment: Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies - Revision Process Overview

cc: Rep. David Hale

Sen. Julie Raque Adams

Sen. Perry Clark

Sen. Alice Forgy Kerr

Rep. Deanna Frazier

Rep. Mary Lou Marzian

Rep. Tommy Turner

# Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies - Revision Process Overview

The Revision Process Overview report is presented in two phases with steps outlining the order the standards revision and development occurred. Each step provides language directly from SB 1 (2017) and a short summary of the KDE's process for meeting the requirements established within the law.

#### Phase 1

Step 1 – Establishment of Committees

According to Senate Bill 1 (2017),

"(c) 1. The department shall establish four (4) standards and assessments review development committees, with each committee composed of a minimum of six (6)

Kentucky public school teachers and a minimum of two (2) representatives from Kentucky institutions of higher education, including at least one (1) representative from a public institution of higher education. Each committee member shall teach in the subject are that his or her committee is assigned to review and have no prior or current affiliation with a curriculum or assessment resource vendor" (p. 13). Further, "(d) 1. The department shall establish twelve (12) advisory panels to advise and assist each of the four (4) standards and assessment review and development committees. 2. Three (3) advisory panels shall be assigned to each standards and assessment review and development committee. One (1) shall review the standards and assessments for kindergarten through grade five (5), one (1) shall review the standards and assessments for grades six (6) through eight (8), and one (1) shall review the standards and assessments for grades nine (9) through twelve (12). 5. Each advisory panel shall be composed of at least one (1) representative from a Kentucky institution of high education and a minimum of six (6) Kentucky public school teachers who teach in the grade level and subject reviewed by the advisory panel to which they are assigned and have no prior or current affiliation with a curriculum or assessment resource vendor" (p.13-14).

The KDE solicited teacher participants through an online survey application. The application was advertised throughout the state using multiple communication methods including, but not limited to, the education commissioner's weekly email to all Kentucky educators, advertisement on the KDE webpage, advertisement on the Kentucky Teacher webpage and formal press releases from the KDE. Application review committees, comprised of KDE employees, reviewed all applications in consideration of selection. The social studies committee used criteria to evaluate and identify those applicants who best represented the knowledge, attitudes, skills, aspirations and behaviors (KASAB) needed to serve on the Advisory Panel (AP) and Review and Development Committee (RDC). The review committee also considered identification of members holistically in keeping with overall demographic factors representative of the state.

Once committee members were identified, the KDE then selected the appropriate number of individuals for both the AP and RDC based upon their individual quantifications and guidelines established in SB 1 (2017). Finally, the names of those individuals identified for consideration of selection were provided to the Commissioner of Education and the Council on Postsecondary Education (CPE) for final review and approval.

Step 2 – Public Comment According to SB 1 (2017),

"(g) 1. The review process implemented in this subsection shall be an open, transparent process that allows all Kentuckians an opportunity to participate. The department shall ensure the public's assistance in reviewing and suggesting changes to the standards and alignment adjustments to corresponding state assessments by establishing a Web site dedicated to collecting comments by the public and educators. An independent third party, which has no prior or current affiliation with a curriculum or assessment resource vendor, shall be selected by the department to collect and transmit the comments to the department for dissemination to the appropriate advisory panel for review and consideration" (p. 14-15).

The Appalachia Regional Comprehensive Center (ARCC) created a public survey detailing the current Kentucky Academic Standards to solicit feedback from the public regarding changes and revisions to the current standards.

This feedback was shared with both the Advisory Panel (AP) and Review and Development Committee (RDC). The ARCC created, monitored and facilitated the survey providing the KDE with a web link to the survey for advertisement to the general public. The KDE advertised the survey link to all stakeholders, including Kentucky educational organizations and partners, regional education cooperatives and advisory committees, via the education commissioner's weekly emails, formal public press release, Kentucky Teacher website, KDE website and various multimedia outlets (e.g., Twitter). The public was given 30 calendar days to provide feedback regarding the current academic standards in the designated content areas outlined in SB 1 (2017). The ARCC compiled all survey results and comments, providing the KDE with a finalized stakeholder survey report that was shared with the AP and RDC members. This report and additional focus group feedback was used to inform the revision process (see Appendix A).

## Step 3 – Standards Advisory Panels

SB 1 (2017) outlined the following duties to be completed by the standards APs:

"2. Each advisory panel shall review the standards and assessments for its assigned subject matter and grade level and the suggestions made by the public and educators. After completing its review, each advisory panel shall make recommendations for changes to the standards and alignment adjustments for assessments to the appropriate standards and assessments review and development committee" (p. 15).

The AP for social studies convened to discuss possible changes to the current Kentucky Academic Standards. AP members received a copy of the ARCC's final survey report along with current research related to their content specific standards, other state standards crosswalks and research-based standards frameworks to help inform and guide changes/recommendations regarding the Kentucky Academic Standards. The AP required multiple meetings to work through the changes and adjustments the groups felt needed to occur. The proposed changes to the standards document then were submitted to the RDC for review and consideration.

## Step 4 – Standards Review/Development Committees

SB 1 (2017) further outlined the role of the standards RDC to "review the findings and make recommendations to revise or replace existing standards and to adjust alignment of assessments to the standards and assessments process review committee" (p. 15).

A representative from the social studies standards AP presented the committee's recommendations for revisions and adjustments to the RDC. The RDC received the ARCC's final survey report, current research related to their content specific standards, other state standards crosswalks and researched based standards frameworks, in conjunction with the AP's recommendations to help inform and guide changes and adjustments regarding the current Kentucky Academic Standards. The RDC made revisions and changes to the standards accordingly, creating a revised draft of the social studies standards. These draft standards then were submitted to the third party, ARCC, for creation of a second public comment survey.

## Step 5 – Second Round of Public Comment

Further written in SB 1 (2017), "4. The recommendations shall be published on the Web site established in this subsection for the purpose of gathering additional feedback from the public" (p.15).

Similar to Phase 1-Step 2 of the standards and assessment process review, the KDE, in partnership with the third party ARCC, created a second public survey detailing the newly revised draft Kentucky Academic Standards to solicit feedback from the public regarding the changes and revisions to the current standards created by the AP and RDC. The ARCC created, monitored and facilitated the survey providing the KDE with a web link to the survey for advertisement to the general public. The KDE advertised the survey link to all stakeholders, including Kentucky educational organizations and partners, regional education cooperatives and advisory committees, via the education commissioner's weekly emails, formal public press release, Kentucky Teacher website, KDE website and various multimedia outlets (e.g., Twitter). Similar to the original survey, the public was given 30 calendar days to provide feedback regarding the current academic standards in all designated content areas outlined in SB 1 (2017). The ARCC compiled all survey results and comments providing the KDE with a finalized stakeholder survey report that was again shared with the AP and RDC members. This report and additional focus group feedback (see Appendix A) was used to inform the revision process.

#### Phase 2

In order to holistically establish a standards document for use by Kentucky educators, Phase 1, Step 3 and Step 4, were repeated in Phase 2 to ensure validity and transparency regarding the standards revision process. Both the AP and RDC for social studies were reconvened to make final adjustments based upon the newly collected public feedback regarding the draft standards the committees had created in Phase 1 of the standards and assessment process. Below are the six steps for Phase 2 of the standards and assessment revision process outlined in detail.

# Step 1 – Standards Advisory Panels

As discussed in Phase 1-Step 3 of this report, SB 1 (2017) outlined the following duties to be completed by the standards AP committees,

"2. Each advisory panel shall review the standards and assessments for its assigned subject matter and grade level and the suggestions made by the public and educators. After completing its review, each advisory panel shall make recommendations for changes to the standards and alignment adjustments for assessments to the appropriate standards and assessments review and development committee" (p. 15).

The social studies AP re-convened to discuss any changes they deemed appropriate to the draft Kentucky Academic Standards based upon the second round of data and feedback collected by the ARCC on the public survey. AP members received a copy of the ARCC's final survey report along with the draft Kentucky Academic Standards. Any changes or adjustments the AP considered necessary to the draft standards were submitted to the RDC for review and consideration.

# Step 2 – Standards Review/Development Committees

Similar to Phase 1-Step 4, Senate Bill 1 (2017) outlined the role of the standards RDC to "review the findings and make recommendations to revise or replace existing standards and to adjust alignment of assessments to the standards and assessments process review committee" (p. 15). A representative from the social studies standards AP presented the committee's final recommendation for revisions and adjustments to the draft standards to the RDC.

The RDC received the ARCC's final survey report over the draft standards in conjunction with the AP's final recommendations to help inform any final changes and adjustments needed to the draft Kentucky Academic Standards. The RDC made revisions and changes to the standards accordingly, creating a final draft of the social studies standards. These draft standards then were submitted to the Interim Joint Committee on Education (IJCE) as outlined in the Step 3 of this phase.

## Step 3 – Interim Joint Committee on Education (IJCE)

According to SB 1 (2017), "The commissioner, on behalf of the standards and assessment process review committee, shall subsequently present the recommendations and the public feedback to the Interim Joint Committee on Education" (p. 15).

The IJCE met on November 19, 2018, to review the recommended changes to the proposed Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies, along with the public feedback informing the revisions to the drafts and the public feedback on the revised draft standards themselves. General topics discussed included: graduation requirements, Kentucky history, the revision process outlined by Senate Bill 1 (2017), public comment solicitation, involvement with social studies and use of the College, Career and Civic Life (C3) Framework.

Step 4 –Standards and Assessment Process Review Committee Report and Determination
The purpose of a report provided to the Standards and Assessment Process Review Committee is outlined in SB1 (2017) as follows,

"5. The commissioner shall subsequently provide a report to the standards and assessment process review committee summarizing the process conducted under this subsection and the resulting recommendations. The report shall include but not be limited to the timeline of the review process, public feedback, and responses from the Interim Joint Committee on Education" (p. 15-16).

A report similar to this one was presented to the Standards and Assessment Process Review Committee which detailed the timeline of the review process, public feedback and responses from the Interim Joint Committee on Education.

Additionally, the committee's role, as outlined in SB1 (2017), is as follows,

"6. After receiving the commissioner's report, the standards and assessments process review committee shall either concur that stakeholders have had adequate opportunity to provide input on standards and the corresponding alignment of state assessments or find the input process deficient. If the process is found deficient, the recommendations may be returned to the appropriate standards and assessments review and development committee for review as described in subparagraph 3 of this paragraph. If the process is found sufficient, the recommendations shall be forwarded without amendment to the Kentucky Board of Education" (p. 16).

The committee, based on their evaluation of the Standards Process Revision Overview report, determined that stakeholders had adequate opportunity to provide input on the standards process, as outlined in SB 1 (2017).

# Step 5 – Kentucky Board of Education (KBE)

KRS 156.160 requires the Kentucky Board of Education (KBE) to establish courses of study for the different grades and kinds of common schools, with the courses of study to comply with the expected goals, outcomes and assessment strategies developed under KRS 158.645, 158.6451 and 158.6453. KRS 156.070(1) requires the KBE to manage and control the common schools and all programs operated in the schools. KRS 160.290 authorizes local boards of education to provide for courses and other services for students consistent with the administrative regulations of the KBE. This administrative regulation incorporates by reference the required academic standards for social studies, which contain the general courses of study and academic content standards for use in Kentucky's common schools.

The KBE received the recommendations of the Standards and Assessments Process Review Committee and reviewed the standards and regulatory changes in consideration of approval and adoption. Between a first and second reading of the standards, as incorporated by reference in 704 KAR 8:060, the KBE directed the KDE to reconvene the Advisory Panel and Review and Development Committee to consider feedback from the KBE, focus groups and additional public feedback. The Advisory Panel and Review and Development Committee reviewed the feedback provided, made revisions to the document, and they deemed the revisions appropriate. Subsequently, the KBE approved adoption of the KAS for Social Studies during its February 2, 2019 meeting. The KBE voted to accept the changes proposed from the Statement of Consideration on April 10, 2019.

# Step 6 – Regulatory Process

Pursuant to KRS Chapter 13A, the administrative regulation and the document incorporated by reference (the Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies) is currently in the administrative review process. Upon completion of the review process, they will become law.

Proposed Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies (standards document with process-related documents): <a href="https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1WXDrTcfynEudE-LH16YJlcTPagacczaR?usp=sharing">https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1WXDrTcfynEudE-LH16YJlcTPagacczaR?usp=sharing</a>

## Appendix A

Individuals and organizations consulted during the revision process for 704 KAR 8:060, Kentucky Academic Standards for Social Studies included:

 APs consisting of teachers, higher education representatives and community members including representatives from the Kentucky Geographic Alliance, the Frazier History Museum, Kentucky YMCA Youth Association and Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis

- RDCs consisting of teachers, higher education representatives and community members including representatives from the Kentucky Historical Society, Kentucky Valley Educational Cooperative and Junior Achievement of the Bluegrass
- Social studies focus groups
  - O Current practicing classroom teachers, instructional coaches and district leaders
  - O Additional focus groups with current practicing classroom teachers and pre-service teachers were conducted in collaboration with the Kentucky Council of Social Studies
- Feedback from the public and the social studies community of the revised, proposed standards: 1,227 respondents (roughly 77.59 percent were teachers) for a total of 5,306 comments
- National organizations such as the Council of Chief State Social Studies Specialists (National Council for the Social Studies Associated Group), National Geographic, etc. provided feedback throughout the process
- Focus groups including representatives from Kentucky education organizations and stakeholders. Representatives from the following organizations participated:
  - Center for Economic Education at Murray State University
  - Central Kentucky Educational Cooperative
  - Current high school students, grades 9-12
  - Green River Regional Educational Cooperative
  - Kentucky Association for Environmental Education
  - Kentucky Center of African American Heritage
  - Kentucky Music Educators Association
  - Kentucky Native American Heritage Commission
  - Kentucky World Language Association
  - McConnell Center for Civic Education and Engagement
  - Prichard Committee
  - The Kentucky Office of Early Childhood
  - The Muhammad Ali Center